



Minutes

Coordination Committee

Monday November 8, 2021, 3:00 – 5:00 pm

Online Webex

Present:

Dr. Bruce Newbold, (Chair)
Abigail Amponsah, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Barry Duffey, Citizen
Dr. Denis Corr, Corr Research Inc.
Fran Scott, McMaster Institute for Health Equity, McMaster University
Geoffrey Knapper, HIEA
George McKibbon, McKibbon & Wakefield Inc.
Giuliana Casimirri, Green Venture
Heidi Levitzky, HIEA
Jahanvi Desai, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
John Lundrigan, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Julie Wedzinga, Stelco
Kerry LeClair, Councillor Nann's Office, City of Hamilton
Mainul Husain, Health Canada
Mark Smithson, Citizen
Nico Strabac, Mohawk College Sustainability Office
Renee Alleyn, Citizen
Shirook Ali, Ecosystem Informatics Inc.
Spencer Skidmore, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Tiffany Singh, Planning & Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Trevor Imhoff, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
Timothy Hung, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

Regrets:

Adriano Mena, Citizen
Alexandra Graham, Citizen
Andrea McDowell, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
Andrew Sebestyen, Stelco
Brian Jantzi, Citizen
Christine Newbold, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Dan Dobrin, Ontario Ministry of Environment & Climate Change
Don Curry, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton

Heather Donison, Green Venture
Kate Flynn, Mohawk College
Katie Chan, U.S. Steel Canada
Kayli Thorp, Mohawk College
Ken Smith, Citizen
Lubna Hussain, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Lucas Neil, Hemmera
Linda Campbell, Energy Office, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton
Matt Adams, University of Toronto
Matthew Lawson, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Megan Sutton, Green Venture
Mike Cortese, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Myles Sergeant, Trees Please
Natalie Stacey, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Patrick Quealey, Environment Canada
Paul Panabaker, Energy Dimensions
Peter Topalovic, TDM, PED, City of Hamilton
Rachel Johnson, TDM, PED, City of Hamilton
Rob Conley, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Sally Radisic, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Sara Yonson, Hamilton Oshawa Port Authority
Sarah Styler, McMaster University
Shelley Rogers, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Stephanie Gasko, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Stephen Burt, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Tom Chessman, Energy Office, Public Works, City of Hamilton

1. Introductions & Welcome

2. Land Acknowledgement

The City of Hamilton is situated upon the traditional territories of the Erie, Neutral, Huron-Wendat, Haudenosaunee and Mississaugas. This land is covered by the Dish With One Spoon Wampum Belt Covenant, which was an agreement between the Haudenosaunee and Anishinaabek to share and care for the resources around the Great Lakes. We further acknowledge that this land is covered by the Between the Lakes Purchase, 1792, between the Crown and the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation.

Today, the City of Hamilton is home to many Indigenous people from across Turtle Island (North America) and we recognize that we must do more to learn about the rich history of this land so that we can better understand our roles as residents, neighbours, partners and caretakers ([source](#)).

3. Approval of October 18, 2021 Minutes

- Revisions brought forward over email have been incorporated
- Acknowledge the emotionally driven presentation & response for the citizen's air quality perspective
- Approved pending these revisions

Presentations:

4. Corporate-wide Climate Change Update Presentation (30 minutes), Trevor Imhoff

- Referenced IPCC reports to outline the urgency of the climate emergency
- Terminology such as *high confidence*, *irreversible*, *unequivocally* used
- Climate clock to signify importance and urgency

Discussion:

- Recommend removing the climate clock from the slide as this is based on no scientific background
 - Taken into consideration, the clock is metaphorical for the time we have left but understand the confusion with scientific terminology on the left and clock on the right
- Historical timeline of City of Hamilton's climate change efforts until the March 2019 climate change emergency was discussed
 - The rest of the presentation focuses on actions since then.

Discussion:

- Clean Air Hamilton was quite involved in some of this work, such as the community consultations in 2013/2014.
 - Components of the Hamilton Climate Change charter came out of CAH and were brought to Board of Health
- City's climate planning falls into two categories for integrated action planning:
 1. Mitigation
 - a. Historical GHG emissions are reported annually on corporate and community levels
 2. Adaptation
 - a. Following ICLEI Canada's building adaptive and resilient communities (BARC) framework
 - City reports to (and is a part of): CDP, C40, GCoM, FCM, WRI, ICLEI
 - 2019 Community Greenhouse Gas Inventory
 - Reports two years in the past
 - Since the 2006 baseline, have seen 33.4% reduction in community-wide GHGs
 - Only significant decrease in GHG levels was a result of the province of Ontario phase out of coal-fired power plants, there is no significant increase or decrease since then.
 - Highest three GHG-emitting sectors: steel industries, heating energy, and transportation
 - 2018 Corporate Greenhouse Gas Inventory
 - GHG emissions trends have been downwards as the City has more control over direct GHGs for buildings owned, wastewater, and corporate fleet
 - Low carbon scenario modelling
 - Actions/policies to be implemented in short and long term to reach ultimate target of carbon neutrality by 2050

- Corporate climate change task force
 - Centralizing climate change reporting, set goals for all departments
 - 9 high impact goals and 51 areas of focus
- High performance buildings
 - Updated corporate energy and sustainability policy
 - City Housing Hamilton completed retrofits, achieved passive housing certification
 - Home energy retrofit funding opportunity: project proposal passed initial FCM phase 1 application.
 - Police Investigative Services building recently attained LEED certification
- Active and sustainable travel
 - Building multi use trails
 - Protecting shoreline for Waterfront Trail (preparing for future climate change impacts)
 - Installation of bike lanes
 - Hamilton Light Rail Transit Memorandum of Understanding has been agreed upon
- Low emission vehicles
 - Green fleet strategy is seeing success and has secured funding
 - Hamilton Street Rail Piloting Ontario first-ever carbon negative bus
 - Continue to work with transit colleagues to explore electrification plans for fleet
- Planning & Climate Lens
 - Climate Impact Adaptation Plan
 - Community Energy and Emissions Plan
 - Flooding and Draining Master Servicing Study
 - Water, Wastewater and Storm water Master Plan
- Procurement
 - City's roster sustainability requirements
 - Landscape architectural services
 - Low carbon products in designs
 - Re-use, recycled materials to avoid use of primary material
 - Avoiding embodied carbon from purchasing primary material
 - Goal sends a message to potential vendors that sustainability is important to the City
- Natural Environment
 - Continue to support tree plantings, tree giveaways, and more
 - Urban Forest Strategy has been drafted, unsure when going for Council approval
- Climate adaptation
 - ICLEI Canada's building adaptive and resilient communities (BARC)
 - Currently at milestone 3: Plan
- Climate Impact Adaptation Plan
 - Equity, Diversity, Inclusion (EDI) lens on climate change adaptation planning
 - Team has engaged 27 community stakeholders and brought a range of diverse voices to the table

- Working on an advancing climate adaptation to extreme heat community project
- Diversity, Health & Inclusion
 - EDI framework approval with mandatory training
 - Urban indigenous strategy (strengthening collaborations, building trust with land stewards)
- Education and Awareness
 - Team mentors Youth Challenge International (YCI) Cohorts
 - Ongoing collaboration with CityLAB
 - Bay Area Climate Change Council (BACCC)
 - Continue to fund Bay Area Climate Change Office (BACCO)
- Next steps
 - Develop and finalize climate adaptation plan & community energy and emissions plans (and other climate actions) into multiyear business and budget plans
 - Creation of efficient and robust way to monitor and track indicators and data to report semi-annually
 - Leveraging and building off community-led momentum to accelerate action across community

Discussion:

- How does building resilience within the city fit in with old infrastructure?
 - Flooding and drainage master services study – looking at existing infrastructure, the city is moving quickly on some projects
 - Old infrastructure is a huge issue, costly to upgrade, need innovative strategies
- There is opportunity to gain significant efficiency gains from old multistory buildings in downtown Hamilton. City can explore potential retrofits depending on federal and provincial grants available.
 - Retrofits are tricky for multi-family residential, high rise buildings
 - Grants historically for, single family detached homes, but can definitely look into this idea
 - Can look to best practices in cities like Toronto who have started retrofit program targeted at high rises
- Waste Heat webinars coming up by Hamilton community enterprises.
 - <https://www.hamiltonchamber.ca/events/public-education-series-decarbonizing-heating/>
- Observation that there are a lot of good plans and strategies, but there are no firm timeframes or targets yet. Implementation is dependent on robust timeframes and there is eco-anxiety amongst youth that stakeholders interact with
 - Community energy and emissions plan: Q1 of 2022
 - Climate adaptation plan: end of Q2 2022
 - Actions, targets, indicators, all must work in tandem and must be put into departmental multi year business plans. Expecting this to be complete throughout 2022
- Urban gentrification: massive policy issue and can have huge impacts on efficiency for the City
 - Upcoming on the council discussion tomorrow, Tuesday, November 9th

- GHG analysis work was done on both growth options, climate change team commented and advocated for a firm boundary
- Concern about a gap in the work City is doing and where the public is
 - Community Energy and Emissions Plan is community-focused, need public buy-in
 - After Official Plan is updated, secondary plans are updated, which influence policies and zoning.
 - Successes of plans are dependent on robust community engagement
 - GRIDS policy on how Hamilton grows goes to council tomorrow, November 9th, the topic is not exactly on gentrification measures, but more on where we are going to grow, as it relates to population growth
 - Secondary planning processes define how a community/area can expect to grow
- A previous expansion on the urban boundary actually made the area much denser and pedestrian friendly.
- Slides will not be shared with the meeting minutes, only after the final copy is finished. Within 3 to 6 weeks.

Discussion Items:

5. Clean Air Hamilton Annual Report 2020 Approval (10 minutes), Dr. Bruce Newbold

- Looking for Annual Report approval before it goes to Board of Health for December

Overview of major changes

- Thank you to CAH members who submitted feedback over email! Done our best to address and incorporate all comments into the updated report.
- Overview of big changes since last draft:
 - Updated Team Picture
 - Send picture if left out to jahanvi.desai@Hamilton.ca to be included
 - Added in contextual introduction before air quality trends (gives background of Hamilton's location, industry presence, and variety of emission sources including the role of transboundary emissions)
 - % contribution of transboundary sources according to HAMS have been added in wherever available through the air quality and trends sections of the report
 - All multi-city comparisons have been grouped together towards the end of the section
 - Conclusion section changed to Acknowledgements – more fitting
- Thank you to Trevor Imhoff and the rest of the CAH Annual Report Subcommittee for their help and support for this document!
- Motion to approve raised by Barry Duffey, Citizen
 - Seconded by Trevor Imhoff, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
 - Nays: 0,

- Abstentions: 0
- Seen as unanimous approval of the Clean Air Hamilton Annual Report 2020.

6. Voting Structure Subcommittee Update (20 minutes), Dr. Bruce Newbold

- After EDI policy, a voting structure was developed by the subcommittee to address concerns about representation when it came to voting decisions
- Very small number of times this would be required. Deemed important to prevent over and under representation
- Outreach to indigenous groups is underway
- There is also a conflict of interest clause taken from the City's documents and voting procedures follow Robert's Rules

Discussion:

- Wording around criteria for public citizens "not to be previously affiliated with any other voting bloc"
 - Change to only not affiliated with another voting bloc – can share the same views and be aligned with views from another bloc despite background
 - Conflict of Interest clause covers these aspects

ACTION: Drop condition 3 and use the conflict of interest clause.

- Question about consensus method use versus voting method use: "and any other issues deemed necessary". Not clear around when the consensus method will be used
 - Consensus method is the first way of going about any issue
 - Voting to be used only in some cases as outlined. Did not want to explicitly state all the other cases, so left it open-ended
 - Consensus building first and foremost
- A definition for consensus would benefit to get everyone on the same page. Currently not defined in this document
 - Consensus does not mean unanimous approval. It is simply a fair opportunity to voice opinions
 - Refer to CAH Terms of Reference, principles of decision-making for the discussion of consensus
 - Voting structure only to be brought in for questions of money, relationship to city, personnel, and as and when deemed appropriate.
- Concern about who gets the vote for McMaster university
 - Not Dr. Newbold as Chair gets a vote as well
 - McMaster Institute for Health Equity might not have the same views as McMaster University, perhaps need a separate McMaster representative
 - Can discuss this further, current McMaster participant to solicit feedback from relevant parties and bring it back to CAH
- Appendix 1 - Voting Structure to be added to the Clean Air Hamilton Coordination Committee – Terms of Reference.

Member Updates:

George McKibbon, McKibbon & Wakefield Inc.

- Opportunity to submit an article that will be presented in the fall of next year.
- Looking back on the history of CAH

Abigail Amponsah, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

- No updates

Barry Duffey, Citizen

- No updates

Dr. Denis Corr, Corr Research Inc.

- Teaching the air quality and climate change course at Mohawk College
- Participated in climate change rally in Toronto
- Continuing the Fresh Air for Kids (FAFK) program

Fran Scott, McMaster Institute for Health Equity, McMaster University

- Institute for Health Equity is organizing a speaker series online next week, on the topic of housing for women in precarious situations
- If interested please get in touch with fscott@mcmaster.ca

Geoffrey Knapper, HIEA

- No updates

Giuliana Casimirri, Green Venture

- Currently have two schools at various stages for FAFK
- Were successful in the RFP bid process, will be supported through CAH funding

Heidi Levitzky, HIEA

- No updates

John Lundrigan, ArcelorMittal Dofasco

- No updates

Julie Wedzinga, Stelco

- No updates

Mainul Husain, Health Canada

- Health Canada is developing Health-Based Air Quality Objectives (HBAQOs) for pollutants in outdoor air
- Looking for reviewers and comments on 122 pollutants, currently in three groups based on priorities.
- Interested members, please reach out to mainul.husain@canada.ca

Mark Smithson, Citizen

- No updates

Nico Strabac, Mohawk College Sustainability Office

- No updates

Renee Alleyn, Citizen

- No updates

Shirook Ali, Ecosystem Informatics Inc.

- No updates

Tiffany Singh, Planning & Economic Development, City of Hamilton

- Reached out to stakeholders re: Bayfront Area strategy
- Tentative meeting date: December 6th, will be confirming with everyone soon

Spencer Skidmore, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton

- Hamilton Chamber of Commerce event on Industrial Waste Heat
- November 25th: 1st of 2 sessions, please promote through networks
 - <https://www.hamiltonchamber.ca/events/public-education-series-decarbonizing-heating/>

Timothy Hung, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

- No updates

Jahanvi Desai, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton

- No updates

Dr. Bruce Newbold, (Chair)

- First UWDW 2022 subcommittee meeting took place last week; brainstormed themes and potential speakers
- McMaster has launched a carbon sink project, property owners allowing the planting of native tree species. 200 trees planted so far.

Next meeting

December 13, 2021

3:00-5:00pm

WebEx