



Meeting Minutes

Coordination Committee

Monday September 13, 2021, 3:00 – 5:00 pm

Online Webex

Present:

Dr. Bruce Newbold, (Chair)
Abigail Amponsah, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Andrea McDowell, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
Andrew Sebestyen, Stelco
Barry Duffey, Citizen
Dr. Denis Corr, Corr Research Inc.
Geoffrey Knapper, HIEA
Heather Govender, Green Venture
Heidi Levitzky, HIEA
Jahanvi Desai, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton
Juby Lee, Environment Hamilton
Julie Wedzinga, Stelco
Kerry LeClair, Councillor Nann's Office, City of Hamilton
Lubna Hussain, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton
Megan Sutton, Green Venture
Mike Cortese, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Myles Sergeant, Trees Please
Nico Strabac, Mohawk College Sustainability Office
Sara Yonson, Hamilton Oshawa Port Authority
Sarah Styler, McMaster University
Shirook Ali, Ecosystem Informatics Inc.
Spencer Skidmore, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Stephanie Gasko, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Tiffany Singh, Planning & Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Trevor Imhoff, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton

Regrets:

Adriano Mena, Citizen
Alexandra Graham, Citizen
Brian Jantzi, Citizen
Charles Hostovsky, Citizen

Christine Newbold, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Dan Dobrin, Ontario Ministry of Environment & Climate Change
Don Curry, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Fran Scott, McMaster Institute for Health Equity, McMaster University
George McKibbon, McKibbon & Wakefield Inc.
Giuliana Casimirri, Green Venture
Heather Donison, Green Venture
John Lundrigan, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Kate Flynn, Mohawk College
Katie Chan, U.S. Steel Canada
Kayli Thorp, Mohawk College
Ken Smith, Citizen
Lucas Neil, Hemmera
Linda Campbell, Energy Office, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Mainul Husain, Health Canada
Mark Smithson, Citizen
Matt Adams, University of Toronto
Matthew Lawson, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Natalie Stacey
Patrick Quealey, Environment Canada
Paul Panabaker, Energy Dimensions
Peter Topalovic, TDM, PED, City of Hamilton
Rachel Johnson, TDM, PED, City of Hamilton
Rob Conley, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Sally Radisic, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Shelley Rogers, Public Health Services, City of Hamilton
Stephen Burt, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Timothy Hung, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks
Tom Chessman, Energy Office, Public Works, City of Hamilton

1. Introductions & Welcome

- Heather Govender, Program Manager, Green Venture
- Myles Sergeant, President, Trees for Hamilton
- Juby Lee, Environment Hamilton
- Julie Wedzinga, Stelco

2. Approval of August 9, 2021 Minutes

- Approved

Presentations:

3. Clean Air Hamilton Funded Projects Updates

(a) Fresh Air for Kids (FAFK) Presentation (15 minutes), Megan Sutton (Presentation Attached)

- FAFK is an air quality education program for young people.
- Work with Dr. Corr and with support from CAH and Ontario Trillium Benefit
- Run four modules in person and virtually

- Pathway to Change process:
 - Track participants & campaign targets, inputs, activities, output targets, and outcome targets
- 2020 presented its own challenges. FAFK leveraged existing relationships and increased flexibility with program offerings and the way air quality data was collected
- Adapted to the virtual classroom by providing pre-recorded videos & live presentations
 - Reached 200+ students
- Virtual program outline
 - Four modules
 - Prior to modules, air quality assessment of school's neighbourhood would be conducted
 - A walkabout of the school's neighbourhood would help measure PM 2.5 & PM 10 levels
- Thank you to the geography department at McMaster for the GIS software which helped with the maps
- Program breakdown:
 - Module 1: Air Quality Education
 - Module 2: Air Quality Monitoring
 - Live video call with Dr. Corr
 - Local AQ data is presented and students are helped with graphing if time permits
 - Module 3: Creating a Campaign
 - Idling effects at drop off and pick up times and impacts on air quality & health.
 - Module 4: Program Wrap-up
 - Live video call. Students present campaign materials and FAFK share certifications of completion
- Key outcomes from FAFK include behaviour change for the families of students who participated
 - Reached 218 students
 - Social media posts reached 34,454 people
 - 92% students increase AQ knowledge
 - Increased their knowledge on actions to improve air quality
- Next steps:
 - Working on an on-demand self guided programming aimed at families and community members
 - Guided programming at companies that serve at-risk communities
 - Hoping to increase reach to more schools in Hamilton

Questions/Discussion:

- An idea is to live stream events, can hit several schools at once
- Promotional video worth checking out
 - <https://greenventure.ca/virtual-programs/>
- In regards to FAFK going to businesses/companies – would students or schools do that? Or is the idea that Green Venture reach out via FAFK?

- Green Venture guiding this program for interested companies
- Also possess huge stack of anti-idling signs that can be shared

(b) Trees for Hamilton Update (15 minutes), Myles Sargeant (*Presentation Attached*)

- Family doctor by profession
- Wanted to clear up confusion on Trees for Hamilton vs. Trees Hamilton vs. Trees Please! organizations
- Worked at a residential setting where men are suffering from addiction
 - 75% have concurrent disorder (substance use disorder and a mental health disorder)
- Also work at St. Peter's hospital – geriatric department with the frail elderly
- Work with vulnerable populations in general
- The origins for Trees for Hamilton were just started planting when purchased a farm. Became land stewards and when ran out of space to plant, sought permission from neighbours to plant on their properties
- Hamilton falls short of the urban forest cover recommendation from Environment Canada, needs organizations in this space to contribute
- Health benefits from trees
 - Mental: depression, anxiety, ADHD, anger/conduct disorder
 - Physical: heart disease, hypertension, T2 diabetes, lung disease, skin cancer, heat exposure, improved immune function
- Trees for Hamilton is currently in their tenth year of operations
 - Past plantings include partnerships with parks, conservation authorities, schools, religious groups, and more
- Also part of the air and tree task force which bring together tree planting groups & the other interested parties in Hamilton
- Trees for Hamilton's niche in this sector is the intersection with health. Three different ways this is done:
 - Facilitate patients exercising in natural landscapes
 - Mental health disorders which benefit from green exposure
 - Patients suffering from addiction help with tree plantings
 - Bring forest to patient (health care sites)
 - Death of ash trees – resulted in increasing heart & lung mortality
 - Study by Green Health Washington Edu
 - Educate about trees & health, climate & health
- Trees for Hamilton in 2021
 - 6 plantings in Spring 2021
 - 7 plantings planned for Fall 2021
- Latest initiative: PEACH

Questions/Discussion:

- Very important to have the human beings and wellbeing point of view. Must push City to be more ambitious in terms of urban canopy cover.
 - Asking CAH to advocate for 40% equitable urban canopy cover in the City

- Trees go beyond carbon sequestration to include air quality benefits as well. Interested in the study that was done that related higher rates of heart disease with emerald ash borer infestations.

ACTION: Myles to send Trevor the study

- Urban canopy: excellent way for green infrastructure to be incorporated right beside grey infrastructure. Trees provide more benefits than grey infrastructure, also provide more public health benefits and do not break down with time
- A future discussion at Clean Air Hamilton can focus on Hamilton's tree canopy policies or programs

(c) Trees Please! Presentation (15 minutes), Juby Lee (*Presentation Attached*)

- Trees Please! is operating since 2016
- In 2020 we were at Homeside neighbourhood
- Used two pieces of Dylos monitors to collect air quality data.
- Also conducted tree inventorying using iTree, which is also used by the Forestry division.
- Conducted air and tree walks in the Homeside neighbourhood
 - Participants looking for d-shaped holes in ash trees – these are signs of infestation
- Trees Please! is doing a free tree and shrub giveaway: https://www.environmenthamilton.org/trees_please
- Focus is on getting the right tree in the right space (if smaller spaces – smaller trees/shrubs given for planting)
- Work supports the urban forest strategy whose aim is to increase urban tree canopy
- Trees are generally more cared for in private spaces than in public spaces.
- All Trees Please! events followed COVID-19 safety protocols
 - Participants had to register
 - Masks were worn
 - Events were held outdoors
 - Sanitized equipment before and after use.
 - Only had small groups.
- Trees Please! was able to meet all goals despite the pandemic
- Next steps:
 - Targeting two neighbourhoods this year
 - 1300 trees to give away: https://www.environmenthamilton.org/trees_please
 - Two community tree plantings planned

Questions/Discussion:

- Ways volunteers can be directed to Trees Please? Are there any capacity issues
 - Email Juby (jlee@environmenthamilton.org)
 - Follow posts on social media
 - Join Environmental Hamilton volunteer list
 - Follow Public Health guidelines for capacity limits and wear masks

Discussion Items:

4. New AQ Monitoring Project (15 minutes), Andrea McDowell & Dr. Shirook Ali (Presentation Attached)

- There are challenges with monitoring air quality in the city with air pointers – these include logistical constraints due to space and requirements for electrical outlets
- Dr. Ali's presentation introduced the portable air quality monitoring devices which provide good data, for similar or identical contaminants for which data is currently collected with air pointers
- This pilot project is expected to run September to March 2021
- Currently mapping out areas of interest and will have 2 fixed locations & 2 mobile routes
 - Routes and fixed locations are still TBD – suggestions welcome in Q/A & email
- Next steps of the project: results to be compared with air pointers. Data analysis on:
 - mobile routes vs. fixed locations
 - park locations vs. locations without green space
- Must be able to assess if this is a good solution to create air quality interventions going forward. Will help us address issues in the urban core for City of Hamilton

Questions/Discussion:

- Will volunteers be needed to ensure monitoring devices are functioning properly – is there engagement available that way? Making sure there are no bugs coming into the devices
 - City of Hamilton is not paying for devices but is paying for services. Ecosystems Informatics looks after devices and this is a subscription-based model.
 - There exists filtration systems on the devices that will prevent bugs going into devices. Volunteers needed to tell us what routes to run through for the mobile van – schools, hospitals, other areas of interest
- What is the output of these devices? What data does it generate
 - Devices measure and report parts per billion for 4 gases
 - Data is displayed via heat maps.
 - Showing actual levels of gases at a granular level (for the mobile devices)
 - For the fixed locations, levels in ppb will be shown on an hourly basis
- What are the 4 gases being recorded
 - Sulphur dioxide
 - Carbon monoxide
 - Ozone
 - Nitrogen dioxide
- Another output is meteorological information.
 - Pressure, humidity, and temperature.
 - Helps with AI

- Recommendations for the map to capture some of the following routes:
 - Heavy industrial trucks are following routes at the heart of the city, passing through sensitive uses such as Hamilton General Hospital campus
 - Wellington, Victoria, east west routes used by trucks
 - On one hand, Hamilton is encouraging active transportation by building cycling infrastructure. However, commuter cyclists find themselves riding with 18 wheeler industry trucks beside them
 - Recommend including three hospitals and their geographical area into the map/areas of concern. Can include cycling routes as well
 - Staff in the city shared map where cycling infrastructure and industry routes overlap with community stakeholders. Can pass this along

ACTION: Lynda to email Andrea information about cycling infrastructure and industry routes overlap

- At McMaster, a student masters defense focused on dominant bike routes in Hamilton

ACTION: Bruce to set up connection between master's student and Andrea.

- Current map focuses a lot in Ward 3

ACTION: Kerry to follow-up separately with Andrea to share comments and recommendations.

5. Air Quality Trends 2020 Update (20 minutes), Abigail Amponsah, MECP

- Preview of the Air Quality Trends that will be mentioned in the CAH Annual Report 2020
- Monitoring stations used for this data are the from the industry stations & city stations
- Suspended Particulate Matter trends have been decreasing overall for the city, however in the last ten years, industry has seen a 10% rise (calculated based on linear regression). Since 2015, values have been under annual objective, and it has been roughly constant since then
- Inhalable Particulate Matter PM10 has seen a decrease in the overall as well as the last ten years in both the city and industry sites. The downward trend continues through 2019 to 2020.
- Respirable Particulate Matter PM2.5 over the past 10 years has followed a reduction of 4% in the city (calculated using linear regression method)
- For sulphur dioxide, industry has been taking precautions to reduce and more work needs to be done to bring the SO2 levels under the annual objective
- Total reduced sulphur has seen significant reduction in the number of hours over 10ppb threshold – this is because of changes and improvements in industry management and operations
- Nitrogen dioxide, between 2019 and 2020, saw a decrease in Hamilton. This can be attributed to being a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, as we saw less cars on the road due to lockdown (Transportation is a major source of NO2 in Ontario)
- No data for downtown levels of benzene and the industry levels are above the annual objective – still much work to be done

- Benzo[a]pyrene industry trends are above annual objective, more work needs to be done to bring these down
- For ground level ozone, trends have fluctuated over the past years, but over the past ten years, there is a decreasing trend. Ozone is typically higher in the summer months.
- Multi-city comparisons
 - Sulphur dioxide, when compared between seven cities in ON over the past 13 years, see higher concentrations in Hamilton and Sarnia due to the heavy presence of industry. In 2020, saw this level fall below the annual objective for Hamilton
 - For the 30 year trends for ozone, the Toronto downtown location was relocated multiple times and is no longer comparable to the previous location. Therefore, a trend line was added in for Toronto East which is similar in its urban nature and therefore makes it comparable to other cities. The trend for ozone for Hamilton is in line with other cities in Ontario
 - For the 30 year trends for nitrogen oxides, the same relocation for the Toronto station was followed and Hamilton is in line with other cities
 - PM2.5 levels for Hamilton, when compared to ten other cities over the past ten years, follow a similar trend. Concentrations are higher than other cities for Hamilton. In 2013, there was a change in measurement technology and an approximate correction factor was applied to data prior to 2013 to make it comparable.
 - For PM2.5 ten year trends' comparison to 4 major cities, Hamilton's overall trends are in line with them
- For many of the contaminants – SO₂, Benzene – the focus is on getting these below the annual objectives
- The impact of the pandemic was seen on NO₂ mainly because of the changes in the transportation sector

Questions/Discussion:

- How were multi-city air quality comparisons done? Hamilton has an extensive monitoring network compared to cities in Ontario, how did the analysis make sure we were comparing apples to apples?
 - Similar monitoring stations were chosen for comparison – that had locations in similar uses, mostly urban settings and downtown stations. These were not compared to industry stations which ensured fair comparisons
- For the multi industry graphs, difficult to figure out which station is representing what location - Industry 1/2/3
 - For this report, focus was distinguishing between city vs. industry
 - MECP open to having that discussion to help display which station is which – Industry 1/2/3

6. RFP Process Feedback (15 minutes), Trevor Imhoff

- Want to get an update on what the CAH funding process was like when aligned to the RFP process from Procurement

- City of Hamilton is committed to working with all stakeholders to update this process. Have it on our teams' work plan to review the process
- Still in the middle of the funding process for 2021 – if raising concerns, please refrain from mentioning details of your project instead please share what you like or did not like about the process in general.

Discussion:

- Feels as though the process has shifted away from accommodating non-governmental organizations to one that is designed for private sector players bidding on large city contracts
- Frustrating as a non-profit because a bidding fee had to be paid, moreover, a certificate of status had to be obtained. Never been asked for this document for previous funding and not receiving this on time resulted in our disqualification
- Being out \$250 for the application to be submitted with no guarantee that funding will be granted. As non-profits, doing good work in the community, but walked away from the process confused about the shift in the process.
- Another aspect was that people beyond Clean Air Hamilton could also apply – how would that be dealt with?
- Not clear on who will be reviewing the applications either – someone from Procurement? Or third party adjudicators?
- Process was a disappointment and also out of pocket some money
- Even if the recovery of the application fee is included in the budget in the application, this is dependent on the bid securing funding. Unlike the bigger private corporations for whom the application fee is a smaller amount.
 - Context for the shift of process: CAH had its own adjudication process, would then submit winning projects to the Board of Health, but due to COVID-19 there was no time to go to Board of Health. Had to follow Policy 11, when our process fell under the eyes of procurement.
 - Will work on reviewing our process and aligning it with the Community Enrichment Fund.
 - Process currently has third-party adjudicators who specialize in air quality work and community engagement
 - Updating the process has been included in work plan. Will work on making it more favourable to NGOs.
- In house bids with full transparency and accountability were not permitted under this new process. Would request an open pathway for a councillors team to request funding. Even through a third party organization.
- Even though the process has evolved over the years, adding some levels of bureaucracy that is needed, it is important to keep it fair and simple because time and resources are also costs for NGOs, beyond the financial costs.
- CAH to email Trevor (trevor.imhoff@hamilton.ca) with feedback if not comfortable sharing at this moment
- City of Hamilton is committed to reviewing the community enrichment fund and will bring back proposals and suggestions in the new year for CAH feedback and comments

7. Upwind Downwind Conference 2022 (10 minutes), Dr. Bruce Newbold

- Table discussion into CAH October meeting in the interest of time
- Start thinking about for next year's conference presentations

Member Updates:

Abigail Amponsah, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

- No updates

Andrew Sebestyen, Stelco

- Announced retirement
- Welcome Julie Wedzinga as Stelco's new environmental manager
- Volunteering to continue with other types of work

CAH wishes you the sincerest congratulations on your retirement 😊

Barry Duffey, Citizen

- Wondering about the status of the EDI policy?
 - CAH approved a working draft.
 - CAH Chair also reached out to the indigenous community group in Hamilton, have not heard back yet. Thinking of next steps.
- In regards to the voting policy, plan to reconvene on that in October
 - Hopefully have an update at the next CAH meeting

Dr. Denis Corr, Corr Research Inc.

- Starting air quality course at Mohawk college
- Working on projects with Rotek
- Looking forward to FAFK presentations for upcoming school year

Geoffrey Knapper, HIEA

- No updates

Heidi Levitzky, HIEA

- HIEA's Fall public meeting scheduled for Wednesday, October 20th 6:00 to 7:00 PM EST.
- Feature presentation by Richard Allen, Special Projects, at the Hamilton Chamber of Commerce titled "**Climate Action – A Look at Waste Heat Recovery for Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions**"
- This free virtual event will be held on Zoom – [register here](#). After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing information about joining the meeting.

Trevor Imhoff, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton

- Thanks to Jahanvi & Andrea during absence.
- As motivated as ever to work on Air Quality & Climate Change portfolio

Juby Lee, Environment Hamilton

- Spread the word for the Trees Please! Free Tree Giveaway:
https://www.environmenthamilton.org/trees_please

Julie Wedzinga, Stelco

- No updates

Welcome to CAH ☺

Kerry LeClair, Councillor Nann's Office, City of Hamilton

- No updates

Lubna Hussain, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

- No updates

Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton

- Continuing Stack Watch Walks in COVID safe ways.
- Aim to keep community members aware and engaged

Andrea McDowell, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton

- Community Adaptation Planning workshop: Vision, Goals, and Objectives is scheduled for the afternoon of October 5th. If you are interested and haven't received an invitation, email Andrea McDowell (andrea.mcdowell@hamilton.ca)

Megan Sutton, Green Venture

- No updates

Mike Cortese, ArcelorMittal Dofasco

- No updates

Nico Strabac, Mohawk College Sustainability Office

- BACCC is working on a low carbon transportation report for Hamilton and Burlington. Aim is to help residents make choices to walk, bike, use public transport to travel between cities. Questions and/or suggestions, please email Bianca Caramento (b.caramento@bayareaclimate.ca)

Sara Yonson, Hamilton Oshawa Port Authority

- No Updates

Spencer Skidmore, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton

- No updates

Stephanie Gasko, Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks

- No updates

Jahanvi Desai, Healthy and Safe Communities, City of Hamilton

- Annual Report Subcommittee meeting next week; will have draft CAH Annual Report 2020 for CAH review for October meeting
- BACCC social media takeover statistics

- Reached 37 unique accounts
- Created 313 impressions (number of times the content was viewed)

Next meeting

October 18, 2021

3:00-5:00pm

WebEx