



Meeting Minutes
Coordination Committee
Mon. November 9, 2015, 3:00 – 5:00 pm
71 Main St W, City Hall, Rm 192

1. Introductions & Welcome

In Attendance:

Denis Corr, Corr Research (Chair)
Brian Montgomery, Air Quality Coordinator, City of Hamilton
Sally Radisic, Public Health, City of Hamilton
Marie McKeary, McMaster Institute for Healthier Environments
Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton
Karen Logan, HIEA Representative, Communication Coordinator
George McKibbon, McKibbon Wakefield Inc.
Jim Stirling, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Andrew Sebestyen, U.S. Steel Canada
Peter Chernets, Citizen
Brian Jantzi, Ministry of Environment and Climate Change
Christine Borselli-Morgan, Citizen
Jayne Crawley, Horizon Utilities Corporation
Deirdre Connell, Green Venture
Matt Adams, McMaster Centre for Spatial Analysis
Debbie Achatz, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Ted Mitchell, Citizen
Heather Arnold, Environment Canada
Jonathan Bastien, Hamilton Conservation Authority
Dan Dobrin, Ministry of Environment and Climate Change
Anna Yusa, Health Canada

Regrets:

Matt Lawson, Public Health, City of Hamilton
Kathryn Enders, Green Venture
Michelle Sergi, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton
Katie Chan, U.S. Steel Canada
Patrick Quealey, Environment Canada
Lorraine Vanderzweilt– Mohawk College
Tom Chessman, Public Works, City of Hamilton
Carolyn Barnes, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Dave Carson, Dundas in Transition
Heather Donison, Sustainability, City of Hamilton
Peter Topalovic, Smart Commute -TDM, City of Hamilton

Meeting Commenced at 3:05pm

- Chris Cutler from Mayor's Office attended as observer
- Mayor was ask to speak, but unable to attend
- Marie McKeary informed group that she would be leaving as member of MIEH

2. Approval of September 10, 2015 Minutes

- Approved
- No meeting held in October

Updates:

3. Hamilton Climate Change Plan – Brian Montgomery

- Plan passed Board of Health and Council
- Good presentation and representation from community involved
- Moving forward what is interest from Clean Air Hamilton?
- Intent is looking at forming a committee on climate change
- Climate work was under Clean Air Hamilton to get things started
- Implementation of the Community Plan is intended for a new committee to be created
- Like Clean Air Hamilton or BARC in model
- Members discussion indicated a desire for separate entities, however have a representative of the new climate committee as a member to keep Clean Air Hamilton informed
- As a topic, climate change should remain on the table
- As a structured piece with implementation and responsibilities, a separate entity makes sense

4. Clean Air Hamilton Projects 2015 - Update

DASH/Greenway/Cross Hamilton escarpment Multi-use Cycling Trail – Matt Adams/Denis Corr

- DASH/MASH Multi Use Trails would run along edge of Escarpment above and below, all the way across town
- Undertook an initial assessment of the below escarpment portion
- Matt presented an on-line map of proposed trails
- Already a number of multi-user trails, but are not linked cross town

- Durand neighbourhood is a gap that could link trails
- No cross town existing trail at this time and some areas require identification of land ownership with groups.
- Have met with Hamilton-Burlington Trails Council, Public Health, Planning & Economic Development and Public Works and all are supportive
- Looking to fund a detailed Feasibility Study now
- Can have a multi-user active superhighway like Calgary and Philadelphia
- Moved from an idea/study to an item to move forward to the City of Hamilton
- Have contacted member of Niagara Escarpment Commission and need to meet with Commission on ideas/vision
- Need to upgrade infrastructure and address maintenance
- Potential \$100K to \$120K project to fund a Feasibility Study for work. Need to approach CAH/City and seek funding.

Questions/comments:

George M – Recall Trails Master Plan by the City in 2007/8, have you looked at it?
 - Also need to identify right of ways in trail system and add to map

Answer – Yes and we have met with a number of organizations

Clean Air Hamilton Outreach/Fresh Air Kids/Totally Transit – Deirdre Connell

Clean Air Hamilton Outreach:

- Participated in the Community Climate Change Plan
- 2 grants pending for leverage on climate work
- 40 new signatories to the Climate Change Charter and 3 new organizations
- Capacity building year for the outreach program

Fresh Air for Kids:

- Current program aimed at Grades 5 to 8
- Interested schools found, but a delay in scheduling for this year

Totally Transit for Kids

- Kids get opportunity to ride HSR bus
- 3 delivery options
- 20 classes this year with 309 students from January to June 2015
- 5 schools with 22 presentations to classes this year
- Challenge emerged with possible school strikes

- Challenge: HSR changed hours of availability of buses

Questions/comments:

Brian M – Make sure that you and Denis connect with Kelly Scott of Public Health Services to integrate their healthy travel plans work with existing schools and the Fresh Air Kids air monitoring program. Good linkage and they are interested in connecting work.

Trees for Hamilton – Karen Logan

- Received funding in September
- Coordinated three Fall plantings: Churchill Park, Mount Albion near the west entrance, and Mount Albion near the east entrance.
- Currently negotiating with the McQuesten Urban Farm project for Spring 2016 planting with remainder of funds
- Reminder to folks that even if individual grants are not large sums, they help match funding from other sources

5. Phase 2 Mobile Monitoring of Hamilton Neighbourhoods – Denis Corr

- Phase 2 addresses fifteen neighbourhoods, along with additional special requests received in the interim, for a total of seventeen neighbourhoods.
- Both vehicular and industrial emissions are still important contributors to air pollution levels in Hamilton, particularly under northeast wind conditions.
- Three general patterns emerged.
- For winds from the southwest (prevailing wind direction) air quality was generally better, with risk levels being somewhat higher closer to downtown and the north central industrial area.
- For winds from the northeast, much higher pollution levels were measured for areas nearer the downtown core and industrial areas, decreasing greatly the farther from these emission sources (with some exceptions).
- For areas farthest from the downtown/industrial emissions, i.e., the band of neighbourhoods around the edge of the City, there was better overall air quality with little difference between south west and north east wind conditions or else there were actually lower values during north east winds.
- There were some notable exceptions to the above patterns:
- Nebo Rd. in the south west of the City was specifically measured at the request of Councillor Jackson's constituents and showed high particulate levels regardless of wind direction.
- The Barton/Fruitland area in Stoney Creek, in the east of the City, showed unexpectedly high particulate levels during north east winds (i.e., away from downtown area inputs), particularly in the Jones Rd. location. Sulphur dioxide levels also contributed.

- Cope St., in the north of the City, beside the north east heavy industry, would have been expected to show higher levels during north east winds, but did not in fact do so.
- Each of these exceptional areas could be studied more closely in the future, either by additional mobile monitoring or by using Public Health Services moveable monitoring stations, the AirPointers.
- Of the seventeen neighbourhoods monitored, all showed some air pollution impacts. Overall increased risk averages for all these neighbourhoods were 2.6% for south west winds and 4.1% for northeast winds increased mortality risk. For winds from the southwest, individual neighbourhoods ranged from 1.3% (Mountain Brow) to 7.2% (Nebo Rd.) increased mortality risk. For north east winds the range was 1.5% (Rymal/Paradise) to 7.9% (Nebo Rd.).

Questions/comments:

Brian J – Any speciation of samples? Any retained samples to examine?

- Would impacts downtown include marine sources? It's emerging as a source

Answer – No speciation of samples. No retained filters, particulate monitoring was with Grimm analyzers. Marine sources were not part of the target list.

Anna Y – Was seasonal monitoring done? What numbers were used in the risk analysis?

Answer – Monitoring was done in all seasons.

- Used the most recent risk values available, the SENES CAH/Hamilton Health Unit report numbers for risk

Ted M – Was air monitoring done for several days or several seasons?

Answer – Monitoring days were spread over several seasons, usually 3 or 4 locations on 1 day to capture specific wind directions

- Note that data are snapshots of pollutants at those locations at those times.

Sally R – Information raises some risk questions. Public can ask am I at risk? Are risks based on location or on wind direction?

Answer – Yes public is at risk, more or less, depending both on location and wind direction for that day. Central downtown and southwest areas have greater risks on NE wind days

6. Upwind Downwind 2016 Conference - Information – Brian M

- Conference is on Monday Feb 22, 2016 at the Sheraton hotel in downtown Hamilton from 8 am to 5pm
- Speakers, agenda, venue, food, audio visual have all been arranged
- Clean Air Hamilton website has been updated with information
- On-line registration should be available in December
- Once set, notifications will be sent out
- Currently seeking student submissions for Conference

- Local universities and colleges in Ontario have been notified
- Sending copy of notification to members to send out to their networks for students and universities/colleges.
- Sunday Feb 21st at Sheraton hotel is free public speaker in afternoon
- Dr. Byron Williston with Wilfred Laurier University on ethics, climate change and justice
- Should be a good talk and event

Issues/Discussion:

7. Clean Air Hamilton Objectives - Discussion – Ted Mitchell

- This item had previously been deferred since Ted Mitchell was out of town
- Ted M. posed several questions and asked whether we should amend Clean Air Hamilton objectives
- What is the effectiveness of Clean Air Hamilton?
- Are we actually making a difference for breathing for people in Hamilton?

Clean Air Hamilton Objectives

Clean Air Hamilton is a multi-stakeholder group dedicated to improving air quality in Hamilton's community. The group is committed to improving citizens' health and quality of life through communication and promotion of realistic, science-based decision-making and sustainable practices.

Formed in 1998, Clean Air Hamilton works to improve air quality in Hamilton by:

- **Initiating research on air quality**
- **Providing policy advice to all levels of government**
- **Encouraging emission reductions amongst companies operating in Hamilton**
- **Promoting behavioural changes amongst individuals living and working in Hamilton**

Discussion:

Denis C – Previous presentations are cases of these objective being addressed, e.g., the mobile air monitoring of neighbourhoods. It is research on local air quality that helps inform policy advice to local and provincial government.

Lynda L – Clean Air Hamilton has value. Opportunity to talk to industry and other partners on air quality and sources.

Ted M – What about personal generated emissions? Seems to be cultural resistance to that.

Denis C – Have to remember that there are legal structures around air quality, anti-idling by-laws

are one way to encourage change in behaviour. With regards to the idling by-law, we developed information to support the by-law

- We also fund outreach to help change personal behaviour to reduce exposure and emissions

Karen L – Stepping back to look at Clean Air Hamilton and what we do

- Representatives provide information, update on what is happening, encourage reductions and make research available to develop policy
- The group does not have the authority or power to do something specific, we make recommendations and suggestions.
- We do not tell Council what to do, they seek advice.

Denis C – We need to be specific about the original intent of this agenda item, potential changes to the objectives of Clean Air Hamilton Is there something we are missing? What else should be here?

Ted M – Look at evidence based sources

- Website should be easier and readable so citizens can identify local sources of emissions
- Emissions are influenced by weather, economic decline, regulations on industry, vehicle standards,
- Clean Air Hamilton's contribution has been small compared to that.
- Somewhere down the road, those emissions are going to go up
- But what about multiple small sources? – small engines, residential burning, motorbikes, diesel engines, Drive Clean exemptions.
- Houses in residential areas, some of them will be larger and have emissions
- The exemptions are the things we are ignoring, small engines are growing in numbers, cement saws, air compressors, generators.

Karen L – Public Health asked us through the City Council to establish a Task Force

- One of the identified projects was airshed modelling to identify sources, that work is underway now
- Clean Air Hamilton has looked at some of this, including providing public information and education and then there is acceptance by public.
- Cannot make everyone do what is their best interest, despite information,
- We do not regulate
- To do more, we would need to get more funding

Denis C

- We need to refocus this discussion to the objectives of our group which was the reason for this agenda item. Specifically, what do we keep, what do we take out?
- Originally the Hamilton Air Quality Initiative (HAQI) was started because of downward slope on air emissions (improvements) had flattened out
- Improving air quality can be a moving target, as things improve, you find what items need addressing more
- We do need to deal with challenges as they come up
- A lot of data comes from industry tracking, the Province and regulations, which can still leave problems out there

Andrew S

- Industry has been doing better
- Monitored data shows this

Denis C

- Since HAQI, we have focussed on emission sources
- Have kept up pressure in these areas for improvement
- We have also focussed on detailed local information and outreach as needed for individuals to take personal responsibility
- We must remember that our goals and objectives have to be relatively high level in order to cover a wide range of sources
- Certainly open to changing goals if group feels it is needed

Andrew S

- The airshed model should help with prioritizing areas we should give attention to
- If an area is identified, can do further monitoring to get at source of emissions
- Track out is an example, if a serious issue we would have to address control methods, what are roles of different stakeholders
- For individual action, education is key
- For example, provide cleaner options for fireplaces
- Do we have a direct way to contribute to individual action, perhaps we need to improve education programs

George M

- Concerned we are having this discussion on - are we on track
- I hear you say we are not dealing with the ethical choices in personal decisions
- Approach the question of choices – buying a car, a house, that item, producing this and that
- This will be a topic raised at the Upwind Downwind Conference coming up, but something we have not gone through as a group – the ethical question

Ted M

- My problem is with math not with ethics
- A hybrid car owner will buy an electric car, but it's not displacing a lot of emissions
- There seems to be something in the culture to avoid dealing with trucks
- Math says avoid trucks, rather than buy electric vehicles to reduce emissions

Denis C

- Is there any specific wording you would suggest to improve the goals or work of the group?

Ted M

- I'm concerned that we do not deserve to be called Clean Air Hamilton
- Why do we not advocate against sources, go for the dirty sources
- Should be called Air Monitoring Hamilton
- Residential wood burning was presented here and did not go forward with action
- Presented by Ted at Board of Health but would have been more effective if had the backing

of Clean Air Hamilton

- More items we could be aggressively attacking as sources
- If you are too political correct as a group, then you are in the way

Denis C

- We are still trying to find if our objectives need to change?
- If there is specific wording you wish to alter, please circulate to members.

Ted M

- Stronger reduction of industry sources
- look at off-road emission sources
- need data to prove things are getting worse

Karen L

- We agree there are challenges
- The Airshed study results will be important to determine where all sources are

Brian J

- Information on off-road sources and products is a major effort right now
- National mobile sources working group on this issue currently
- Environment Canada has access to better data, Province is awaiting these data
- Sources include off-road construction and two stroke engines of any type
- Need fuel emission standards for these products, however still have old products out there
- Once we have federal data, we will have a top 10 list of diesel sources in Province
- Vancouver looked at an off-road user fee
- Could dovetail with the airshed model

Anna Y

- Also, Change out programs for lawnmowers exist

Brian J

- Mow Down Pollution
- Car Heaven programs in Ontario also worked at getting old products off the market

Jim S

- This has been a good discussion
- How can Clean Air Hamilton engage more at that level of issue – individual and small residential sources?
- Should a group be formed to look at those sources and get data to support action

Brian J

- Data is needed and more information made available
- There exists general data on large populations of products, but not on neighbourhood level
- Once data available, should Clean Air Hamilton pursue?

Items:

8. Standing items on agenda – Industry Updates– Lynda Lukasik

- Would like to add a standing item to meeting agendas
- Updates from Industry
- Help bring members of Clean Air Hamilton up to speed on what is happening
- Relating to Risk Thresholds exceeded
- Environmental Bill of Rights postings
- Items presented at Community Liason Commitees of industries
- Site specific standards
- Feel that group is not hearing enough on these items at meetings from industry representatives

Action item: Add Industry and Partner Updates as Standing Items at Meetings

Meeting Adjourned at 5:05 pm

Next meetings:

December 7, 2015

3:00-5:00pm

City Hall Room 192/193