

Meeting Minutes

Coordination Committee Mon. March 13, 2017, 3:00 – 5:00 pm 71 Main St W, City Hall, Rm 192/193

In Attendance:

Denis Corr, Corr Research (Chair) Trevor Imhoff, Public Health, City of Hamilton Lynda Lukasik, Environment Hamilton Andrew Sebestyen, U.S. Steel Canada Peter Chernets. Citizen Michael Gemmel, Green Venture George McKibbon, McKibbon Wakefield Inc./University of Guelph Brian Montgomery, Public Health, City of Hamilton Eniber Cabrera, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton Rachel Poon, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton Andrea McDowell, Public Health, City of Hamilton Rachel Johnson, Smart Commute -TDM, City of Hamilton John Lundrigan, ArcelorMittal Dofasco Christine Borselli-Morgan, Citizen Michelle Cassar, Health Canada Karen Logan, HIEA Representative, Communication Coordinator Susan Chapman, The Lung Association – Ontario Joshua Parkinson, Student, Mohawk College

Regrets:

Jonathan Bastien, Hamilton Conservation Authority
Heather Donison, Sustainability, City of Hamilton
Matt Adams, Associate Professor - Ryerson University
Anna Krol, Health Canada
James Kaspersetz, OEAC
Adriano Mena, Citizen
Weeberb Réquia, McMaster University
Brian Jantzi, Citizen
Ted Mitchell, Citizen
Barry Duffey, Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change
Fran Scott, McMaster Institute for Healthier Environments

Patrick Quealey, Environment and Climate Change Canada
Lorraine Vanderzwelt– Mohawk College
Shivani Vigneswaran, Environment and Climate Change Canada
Carolyn Barnes, ArcelorMittal Dofasco
Peter Topalovic, Smart Commute -TDM, City of Hamilton
Joel Konik, Hamilton Conservation Authority
Paul Szachlewicz, Horizon Utilities Corporation
Alexandra Graham, Citizen
Matt Lawson, Public Health, City of Hamilton
Sally Radisic, Public Health, City of Hamilton
Dan Dobrin, Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change
Christine Newbold, Planning, City of Hamilton
Mark Smithson, Ministry of the Environment and Climate Change
Katie Chan, U.S. Steel Canada
Kirsten McCauley, Planning and Economic Development, City of Hamilton

Meeting Commenced at 3:04 pm

1. Introductions & Welcome

2. Approval of March 13, 2017 Minutes

Approved

Presentations:

Cap & Trade Information Session – Andrea McDowell (20 minutes)

Link to Presentation:

- Similar presentation for Council members with some slight changes. Cap & trade are carbon emissions that are capped and reduced overtime. Companies can trade emission permits and offsets to cover amount of carbon they emit.
- Several types of carbon pricing initiatives across the world, most common are cap & trade and carbon tax. Carbon tax places a one-time tax where a cap & trade creates a carbon market. Ontario's cap & trade is linked with California's and Quebec's cap & trade markets referred to as the Western Climate Initiative (WCI).
- Ontario is pursuing cap & trade to lower emissions as emission are free for companies, but not
 for society. Costs of emissions include illness and injury, refugees, infrastructure damage etc.
 Cap & trade is a form of polluter pays that incorporates price of carbon into the costs of goods
 and services.
- Companies entering the cap & trade market must register as bidders and prove financial ability to purchase permits. First auction occurred in March 2017 and generated approx. \$460 million with anticipated revenues of \$1.4 billion within the first compliance period (2017-2020)
- Cap & trade will impact the community by paying higher prices for fuels, which will also impact costs of other goods and services. Businesses and residents who can reduce emissions, develop emission-reducing technology may benefit.

• Legally revenues generated must be re-invested back into emission reductions projects and initiatives. MOECC Climate Action Plan identified themes such as electric vehicle infrastructure for funding.

Questions/Discussions:

- Denis C. Asking about size of Ontario/California/Quebec economy as one of the largest in the world.
 - o Andrea M. Unsure if one of the largest, must be top 10.
- Eniber C. Asking when MOECC funding programs starting
 - o Andrea M. When asking province, only response is "soon"
 - o Brian M. Recently calls for proposal for Green Bank committee.
- Lynda L. Asking if results of the auction available to the public. E.x which companies bought how many permits or which companies did not participate.
 - o Andrea M. Unsure if that information is available to the public.
 - Andrew S. Companies can see who is registered, but other than that it would be kept private.
- George M. Earlier discussion about rural forest as offset, still considering?
 - Andrea M. Previous discussion paper released, very specific about calculating offsets, believe final is still in progress
- Eniber C. Asking if companies fail to participate and do not meet cap are there any fines.
 - Andrea M. Compliance period ends in 2020 and if companies fail to acquire enough permits and/or offsets to cover emissions, company will be fined.
- Denis C. Asking average cost of permits.
 - Andrea M. Average just over \$18/tonne which is just above minimum price set by government of \$18/tonne
- Denis C. Asking if municipalities are getting involved.
 - o Brian M. Hamilton looking at it for awhile now, waste to energy technology.
- George M. Six Nations trading with New York, just not here yet.
 - o Andrea M. Interested, as discussion paper outlines that offsets cannot pass country jurisdictions.
- Joshua P. Asking how re-sale of permits regulated. E.x could company buy a large amount of permits early and then sell those permits to companies rushing to become complaint near the end.
 - Andrea M. Cap & trade creates a trading market so hypothetically possible.
- Denis C. Asking how will businesses and individuals be able to get funding through the Green Bank? Need go through municipality?
 - o Brian M. Possibly, traditional method of teaming up with municipality and applying through municipality.

 Lynda L. – Section in MOECC Climate Action Plan for not-for-profits stream, but also multiple avenues available to acquire money.

Greenhouse Gases of Transportation – Brian Montgomery & Trevor Imhoff (15 minutes)

- Presentation at 2017 Transportation Summit. Hamilton member of Compact of Mayor's, coalition of mayors and city officials committed to reduce local greenhouse gas emissions. Hamilton joined in 2014, and has set its own GHG reduction targets that align with Provincial targets.
- Requires municipalities to inventory community GHG emission and follow global internationally recognized standards.
- Hamilton and Burlington similar in that approx. 40% of GHG emissions are from transportation sources. Different years because Hamilton does yearly inventory and we have excluded large industrial sources because just in this comparison.
- Global protocols breakdown transportation related emissions by three different scopes. Gets tricky when you start looking at scope 3 emissions say from Hamilton airport.
- Several approaches for calculating transportation emissions identified in protocols. Preferred method is bottom-up approach that uses detailed activity data. Top-down approach starts with fuel consumption. Hamilton hires consultant to give fuel sales for all of Hamilton.
- ASIF framework recommend framework that incorporates activity data, fuel sales, mode share
- Induced activity approach utilized in the U.S and a preferred method of GPC that relies on traffic models or surveys to asses number and length of all on-road trips. Difficulty of approach is if using different models could exclude some in city travel that should be disclosed in inventory.
- Geographical approach utilized in Europe and quantifies emissions from activity occurring solely within city boundaries. Used to estimate air pollution or traffic pricing. Resident activity approach requires information such as vehicle registration records, vehicle kilometers travelled (VKT). This approach excludes impact of non-city resident traffic by commuters etc.

Questions/Discussion:

- Lynda L. Asking if possible to calculate emission reductions from modal shift to more public/active transportation modes.
 - Brian M. Using activity data or traffic models could estimate, could even be sales pitch to province to show how we are helping to meet GHG reduction targets
- Andrew S. when calculating offsets for cap & trade very specific calculations, verifications etc. community inventory estimating, not sure how province would handle that.
- Denis C. City now has cameras that do automatic traffic counts.
 - o Brian M. fairly new program but if we can get that data could provide with a very rich dataset.

Updates:

3. Active and Sustainable School Event March 23, 2017 – Denis Corr (5 minutes)

- Denis C. Event focused on Dr. Adam's research of air pollution due to idling vehicles at morning school drop off locations. Expanded to include Clean Air Hamilton's Fresh Air For Kids program. Became great event with a lot of publicity, included attendance from school board chairs, directors and superintendents, Hamilton's AMOH Dr. Tran
- Trevor I. Great event, blown away by children's presentation not only on speaking ability but knowledge of air quality. Denis did Fresh Air For Kids program over 2 years ago and they are still very passionate about it. Great publicity opportunity for Clean Air Hamilton to grow awareness of group to the local community
- Michael G. Very impressed by all student presentations, specifically student from Fessenden.

4. Upwind Downwind 2018 Conference Update – Upwind Downwind Planning Committee (Christine, Brian, Fran, George, Karen, Trevor, Sally)

- Trevor I. Upwind Downwind planning committee established and so far have had two meetings. Have confirmed date for conference of March 4 & 5 2018. Overall theme of conference will be around the Hamilton airshed model and an air zone management approach. Inviting Sarnia-Area (City of Sarnia & Township of St. Clair) to attend and municipalities will present case studies/projects.
- Christine B.M This year would like to go with a more interactive community approach.
- Trevor I. Sub-themes of the conference include transboundary Canada-U.S emissions, MOECC modelling, MOECC cap & trade update, changing governance in a trying time, local actions/research. As for Sunday event really trying for more interactive event like an "air quality fair" where citizens can come in and search address to find out air quality.
- Christine B.M Theme of changing governance and era of constant resource reduction relates to one my previous professors Dr. Kernaghan Webb, Associate Professor and Chair of Ted Rogers School of Management – Law and Business program at Ryerson University.
 - Link to Biography: http://www.ryerson.ca/tedrogersschool/bm/programs/law-business/kernaghan-webb/
- Brian M. Really trying to change to a more interactive theme this year. Not just with airshed model but also with HAMN, Denis' mobile air monitoring, Environment Hamilton's BAM/INHALE programs etc. and really teaching individuals.
- Christine B.M Focusing on bring awareness to the community, not only what can be done, but also on what is being done.

5. 2017 Clean Air Hamilton Funding Update – Group Discussion (20 minutes)

- Denis C. Provided update on previous January meeting minutes relating to new funding process.
- Trevor I. PHS created applications, guideline document and scoring criteria which was adapted from documents proposed for POA fine money which was adapted from City Enrichment Funding. Confirmed three external adjudicators to review and score applications. MOECC staff, City Transportation staff, and retired professor from U of T. Adjudicators provided great feedback for each application as well as feedback on the overall process. After scoring and feedback it was clear there are gaps in information, clarification needed between what adjudicators are using for scoring criteria and what is communicated to applicants. 4 out of the 5

- applications received a failing grade (less than 60 points), those applications that failed were given detailed feedback on how to improve application, have re-submitted and those applications are now being re-scored by the adjudicators.
- Denis C. 4 out of the 5 applications failed and all applicants were reputable organizations.
 Unsure about scoring breakdown, needs improvement. The idea of research grants is to foster ideas and innovation. Getting very difficult to get funding. Just to apply need \$2 million liability insurance.
- George M. Subjectively as someone not applying for any grants, if 4 out of 5 applicants failed, then something needs to be fixed.
- Karen L. Asking about comparison between CEF outcomes and whether or not this was just CAH.
 - Trevor I. Spoke with previous adjudicators of CEF, reality of grant applications that feedback is always given and applicant than re-submits or gives additional information to receive passing score.
- Andrew S. Asking if there is prescribed standards/protocols for failed applications
 - Trevor I. Nothing is in writing, the failed applications were unforeseen, but we are working with applicants and allowing them to re-submit with additional required information.
- Lynda L. Experience with applying for ON Trillium grants & CEF, must provide insurance only if income is greater than \$250,000. Organization viability scored very differently between two applications. Wondering how applicants scored on that.
 - Trevor I. No application scored well for organizational viability. This is an example of something that can be changed moving forward with greater clarification on what is required.
- Denis C. Weighting for scoring needs re-assessment, feels scoring for actual project is smallest part.
- Karen L. Arts award funding process now is much more transparent, updated 4-5 times previously to get there. ON Trillium gives exact same criteria to public that adjudicators use.
- Denis C. Grateful for funding, however been making steps moving away from actually being CAH projects.
 - Trevor I. Fairly new to CAH, but understand that this process was discussed as way to remove bias decision making/voting. CAH provided input on criteria when developing it for POA/CEF applications.
- George M. Putting motion on table to hold funding until process can be resolved.
 - o Trevor I. clarification on motion wanted to hold this year's funding process. Report to BOH due very soon and could result in no funding being issued this year.
 - Karen L. Asking if wording can be put into this year's report about CAH reservations about new funding process.
 - o Denis C. There is timeline issues for this year's funding
 - o Trevor I. Best case scenario and recommend we proceed with this year's funding, update wording in BOH report and motion to proceed with updating CAH funding

- process with PHS as soon as possible.
- **General consensus was met around the table.
- Denis C. Asking for interested candidates to approach PHS and work them to update funding process
- o **George M. and Karen L. volunteered

6. Member Updates (15 minutes)

Susan Chapman – The Lung Association - Ontario

- The Lung Association big advocate working with province to reduce coal fire generation. Meeting last week discussing clean coal technology and asking feedback from group
 - o General consensus was not feasible

Karen Logan – Hamilton Industrial Environmental Association

• HIEA Annual General Meeting tomorrow night @ 5:30PM. Great food and speakers.

Peter Chernets – Citizens

- Asthma Society of Canada starting mentorship program "Asthma Pals Mentorship Program"
- Link to website: http://sandboxproject.ca/news/2017/2/22/new-asthma-pals-program-for-kids

Lynda Lukasik – Environment Hamilton

- Spring is here and concerns about dust and vehicle track out.
- City contracting out street sweepers and want to learn more.

Brian Montgomery – Hamilton Public Health Services

- Big meeting with Province and Burlington to discuss climate change initiative.
- Now certified to complete International GHG inventories.

Rachel Johnson – Smart Commute -TDM, City of Hamilton

- Spring into Spring Block Party event hosted at Margueritte d'Youville Public School, April 19 between 7:30AM and 10AM.
- Wear yellow/walk to school to day

Action Items:

- Trevor I. to send Dr. Webb's Biography link to CAH members.
- Trevor I. to setup meeting with Matt Lawson, George and Karen.

Meeting Adjourned at 5:05 pm

Next meetings:

May 8, 2017 3:00-5:00pm City Hall Room 192/193